

TOWN OF HINGHAM

Historic Districts Commission



MEETING MINUTES

DATE: 3/25/2021

PLACE: Remote meeting via Zoom

MEMBERS PRESENT: Collard, von der Luft, Pyles, Daley, Aborn, Burnham, Edson, Shriver

MEMBERS ABSENT: Donaldson

The Chair called the duly noticed meeting to order at 6:30 pm. Regular Members Michael Collard, Chairman, Carol Pyles, Catherine Daley, Hans von der Luft, and Justin Aborn were in attendance. Alternate Members Ben Burnham and Robert Edson were in attendance and Commission Administrator Andrea Young was also present. The Chair noted for the record that the proceedings were being recorded by the Commission and asked that others who may wish to record the meeting announce this in order to inform others attending the meeting.

The Chair noted that the Voting Members for this meeting include The Chair, Michael Collard, Carol Pyles, Catherine Daley, Justin Aborn, and Hans von der Luft.

6:32 pm Hearing: 19 Middle Street
For the applicant: David and MaryBeth Leiphart

The Chair noted that Alternate Member Ben Burnham has a conflict with this application and that he would not be participating in the hearing. The Chair opened a hearing on an application from David and MaryBeth Leiphart, 19 Middle Street, located in the Hingham Centre Local Historic District, for changes to the existing barn, including new windows, garage door, man door and exterior lighting.

The Applicants presented the proposed plans to the Board, explaining that they hope to replace six windows that are not insulated and cannot be locked, change the current sliding doors to a functional garage door, replace the existing man door with an insulated and lockable door, and add exterior lighting. She noted that the windows are from 2011 and the barn doors are also not original. The windows will be replaced with Marvin six over six windows, the garage door will be 14' 6" wide by 7' 9" high, either solid cedar or mahogany, and made to look like two barn doors. The man door will be wood with light fixtures on either side.

Members of the Commission discussed with the Applicant the size, and design of the proposed garage door, the layout and type of windows that are proposed and if simulated divided light glass is appropriate for this application. The Commission also discussed the possibility of incorporating an existing stained-glass window into the proposed design.

The Chair invited a motion.

MOTION: Hans von der Luft, seconded by Justin Aborn moved for a Certificate of Appropriateness for 19 Middle Street to replace six windows with Marvin Integrity six over six simulated divided light all wood windows. The applicant has the option on the non-street facing side to use a different material for the windows, given that they are not visible from a public way. Garage door to be replaced with the ranch house door, depicted on page 2 of the application, a 14' 6" wide by 7' 9" high cedar wood-stained tongue and groove garage door as pictured, all wood. The existing man door facing Middle Street will be replaced with the door depicted in letter C on the application, a 12-light insulated glass window door, painted to match the existing door color. Lanterns to be installed on the Middle Street side as depicted by letter D, Hinkley aged zinc lanterns. The homeowner has the option to incorporate the existing diamond windows pulled from the garage doors where most appropriate. The Applicant will submit their final window choice to the Commission.

IN FAVOR: Carol Pyles, Catherine Daley, Hans von der Luft, Justin Aborn, Michael Collard

OPPOSED: None

The motion passed unanimously.

7:03 pm Hearing: 274 South Street
For the applicant: Kevin Whalen, Chris Rotti, Rick Pomroy

The Chair opened a hearing on an application from South Shore Country Club, 274 South Street, located in the Lincoln Local Historic District, to construct a new 7,100 sq. ft. storage facility as part of a larger maintenance facility master plan.

Kevin Whalen, Chris Rotti, the project designer, and Rick Pomroy, from Pomroy & Associates, presented the application to the Commission on behalf of the Applicant, the South Shore Country Club Management Committee. Kevin Whalen explained that the current maintenance facility is failing, and a new facility will allow operations to continue running smoothly. The proposed maintenance storage facility will be 128' x 55'. He noted that this project is part of a phased master plan for improvement across the Country Club.

Chris Rotti presented the proposed plans, noting that the master plan includes 3 buildings, with building "A" on the plans being the equipment storage and maintenance facility that will be constructed first. He explained that all of the buildings would be wood frame with pre-finished fiber cement horizontal siding with a 5-inch exposure, an asphalt shingle roof, trimmed punched openings with simulated divided light windows, false barn doors with punched openings and either a window or a louvre in the gable end; functioning 14'x12' overhead doors, and a paint color to be determined. He added that due to the large scale of this project, they will need to create a bio retention basin to appropriately handle the stormwater.

Members of the Commission discussed the proposed plans, focusing on the siding and roof materials and possible other material options, the grade and the scale of the proposed building, the level of the retention area, the location of the buildings, and the color of the buildings. The Commission suggested that the Applicants take another look at possible exterior materials and pricing for other siding options versus the hardy plank siding, and for a metal roof as opposed to asphalt in order to compare costs against the longevity of the materials, and to consider how the selected paint color will weather over time.

The Chair invited a motion.

MOTION: Michael Collard, seconded by Justin Aborn, made a motion to issue a Certificate of Appropriateness to 74 South Street, to build a new maintenance facility based on documents reviewed at the March 25, 2021 meeting. The Certificate of Appropriateness is for Building "A" and related site work based on grading and site plans submitted. Applicant is to review exterior materials and submit the final material selection for review. The Applicant is to consider red cedar, Boral, and Hardie Board for exterior materials. Applicant is also to consider an asphalt roof versus a metal roof. Windows are to be Anderson A Series fiberglass. Applicant is also to submit details of the false barn door as well as any other trim and skirt details. Applicant is to propose color considerations based on material selection and maintenance required. Final color to be determined at a later date.

IN FAVOR: Carol Pyles, Catherine Daley, Hans von der Luft, Justin Aborn, Michael Collard

OPPOSED: None

The motion passed unanimously.

8:07 pm Hearing: 339 Main Street
For the applicant: Captain Dave Levinson/Chief Murphy

The Chair opened a hearing on an application from the Town of Hingham for the Central Fire Station, 339 Main Street, to replace the existing slate roof with architectural asphalt shingles. He noted that members of the Commission have previously conducted a site visit for this application.

Fire Captain David Levinson presented the Application to the Board. He explained that half of the existing roof is original, and half was replaced during previous renovations, the original half being in such bad condition that pieces fall off and there is no protection underneath with regards to water intrusion. He further explained that they are requesting to completely replace the roof with a material like a GAF slate line asphalt shingle. He noted that BEA is currently doing a study on the roof of the building and provided them with rough price estimates for redoing the roof with asphalt shingles which would cost approximately \$261,000, with the slate roof option being substantially more expensive at \$433,000. He added that along with the roof, they are looking to replace the wood exterior trim with composite material and replace the gutters.

Fire Chief Steve Murphy added that they will also be looking to add more porticos over the doors around the building. He also noted that this hearing is to determine whether the Commission would consider the use of a material other than slate for the roof and that, because the project will be costly, the budget for the project will likely have to be a warrant article at Town Meeting 2022, meaning they are about a year away from obtaining the funds for the project.

Members of the Commission and the Applicants discussed the application at length, focusing on the state and material of the current roof, the possibility of repairing the roof, the various potential costs of the proposed project, the proposed gutter replacement, maintaining the historic integrity of the appearance of the building, the timeline and procurement process of a project of this size, and the appropriateness of using asphalt shingles or a metal roof for this project.

There was additional discussion among Commission members about the effectiveness of granting a Certificate of Appropriateness for the project before the completion of the roof study and the possibility of a motion not being determinative enough. The Chair noted that a motion would give the applicants the flexibility to explore multiple materials and cost options for the project.

The Chair invited a motion.

MOTION: Hans von der Luft, seconded by Michael Collard, moved to grant a Certificate of Appropriateness for 339 Main Street, for replacement of the original slate roof and the slate 2.0 on the addition. The Fire Department can either reroof the building with slate, or asphalt shingles. A metal roof on the addition may also be an option. The Applicant is to provide the details on which direction they would like to go in in the future for the roof material and will send specifications of the materials to the Commission. This motion also includes the replacement of exterior wood fascia, soffit and window casings with a paintable composite material to be determined at a later date. Replacing wood exterior elements with wood is also appropriate for this application. All gutters are to be repaired to be and integrated. Measured drawings will be required before proceeding with construction of the porticos. Trim color and gutters are to match existing.

IN FAVOR: Catherine Daley, Hans von der Luft, Justin Aborn, Michael Collard

OPPOSED: Carol Pyles

The motion passed.

9:15 pm Hearing: 228 South Street
For the applicant: John Winter

The Chair opened a hearing on an application from John Winter, 228 South Street, located in the Lincoln Local Historic District, to install a brick walkway and construct a stone wall, both at the front of house.

John Winter presented the Application to the Commission. He explained that the project includes installing a 2 ft. high freestanding stone wall along the property line, creating a walkway from the opening in the stone wall to the front door, and adding lighting to the piers planned for either side of the opening in the wall. He presented multiple options for stone and lighting for the project and referenced the stone wall located on a neighbor's property as an example.

The Commission and Applicant discussed the various material options, noting that the stacked field stone option seemed most appropriate for the stone wall. Commission members determined that this project should not include lighting as it would not be historically accurate.

The Chair invited a motion.

MOTION: Michael Collard, seconded by Carol Pyles, made a motion for a Certificate of Appropriateness for 228 South Street for the installation of a stone wall, based on drawings submitted as part of the Hingham Greenbush Historic Preservation Trust application dated October 16, 2020. The stone wall is to be 2 ft. high, stacked field stone, similar to the image as part of the application. No exterior lighting is approved as part of this motion. The wall is to be set back approximately 10 ft. from the roadway. The piers that frame the opening are to be approximately 8 inches taller than the wall and have no cap. The brick walkway is to be based on plan layout images submitted as part of the application

IN FAVOR: Catherine Daley, Hans von der Luft, Justin Aborn, Carol Pyles, Michael Collard

OPPOSED: None

The motion passed unanimously.

9:40 pm Approval of minutes

The Chair opened discussion on the minutes from January 14, 2021 & February 11, 2021. No changes made. The Chair invited a motion.

MOTION: Michael Collard, seconded by Justin Aborn, made a motion to approve the minutes from January 14, 2021 and February 11, 2021.

IN FAVOR: Catherine Daley, Hans von der Luft, Justin Aborn, Carol Pyles, Michael Collard

OPPOSED: None

The motion passed unanimously.

The meeting adjourned at 9:47 pm.

Respectfully submitted,
Julia Murphy